

In the name of God, the Merciful, the Compassionate

Republic of Sudan
National Audit Chamber (NAC)

A Report on the preparedness of the Republic of Sudan to Implement the Sustainable Development Goals 2015-2030

THE GLOBAL GOALS
For Sustainable Development



Contents

SN	Topic	Page No
1	Introduction	3
2	Methodology	3
3	Sustainable Development Goals	4
4	Preparedness of the Republic of Sudan	5
5	Findings	12
6	Recommendations	13

1: Introduction

The Sustainable Development Goals are wide-ranging and cover almost all areas of public policy and service delivery, ranging from health care to education and environment protection as well as institutional and governance aspects. They also ensure the participation of the various stakeholders and their scope. Thus, countries from across the globe have reached various stages of alignment of their national development plans to the new goals. This trend will continue to evolve as the Sustainable Development Goals progress within its time–frame for 15 years.

NAC will initially focus on the preparations made by the government to implement the Sustainable Development Goals and thereafter concentrate on the adequacy of the actions related to the monitoring and evaluation of the systems employed to follow up and report on the Sustainable Development Goals. That can be achieved when the NAC is tasked with the duties of a financial audit, or reviewing performance and compliance. The various aspects of performance in the public sector will be independently assessed as well as making objective assessments on the level of service provision, besides policy results that relate to the implementation of the sustainable development goals in the coming years. Thus, the Chamber will assist in building transparent, efficient and accountable institutions (goal 16 of sustainable development goals)

NAC continues its commitment of being an example to be emulated for transparency and accountability in its operations and activities.

2: Methodology

INTOSAI methodology will be pursued to review the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, which outlined four broad approaches as follows: -

- i. Assess the readiness of national governments to implement the Sustainable Development Goals and monitoring and reporting the progress, subsequently overseeing their actions and verify the reliability of the provided data.
- ii. Conduct performance audits that assess the levels of efficiency, effectiveness of key government programs that contribute to certain aspects of the Sustainable Development Goals.
- iii. Assess and support the implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 16, which relates to establishing transparent and effective institutions and accountability.
- iv. The Supreme Audit Institutions should serve as an example for transparency and accountability in their own operations, including monitoring and reporting tasks.

Since the units are subject to review at the stage of establishing strategies and detailed plans to include the Sustainable Development Goals in respective areas, this report will concentrate on the readiness of the state/ government.

3: Sustainable Development Goals

The document outlined 17 goals and 169 objectives signed by the Republic of Sudan as one of 193 countries in September 2015. The details of these goals are as follows: -

- i. End poverty in all its forms everywhere.
- ii. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture.
- iii. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages.
- iv. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all.
- v. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls.
- vi. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all.
- vii. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all.
- viii. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all.
- ix. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation.
- x. Reduce inequality within and among countries.
- xi. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable.
- xii. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns
- xiii. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts.
- xiv. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development.
- xv. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss.
- xvi. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels.
- xvii. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development.

These goals will be rolled out in Sudan under three strategic plans 2017-2020, 2020-2025, 2025-2030 according to the priorities established, focusing on unfulfilled goals of the Millennium Development Goals which ended in 2015, those goals that the audit will focus on and report them for subsequent years according to their implementation programs, ie:

- Goal No. (1) End poverty in all its forms everywhere.
- Goal No. (2) End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture.
- Goal No. (3) Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages.
- Goal No. (4) Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all.
- Goal No. (5) Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls.

- Goal No. (6) Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all.

Those, in addition to three (3) goals contained in the Sustainable development goals 2030

- Goal No. (10) Reduce inequality within and among countries.
- Goal No. (16) Just, peaceful and inclusive societies. Goal 16 of the Sustainable Development Goals is dedicated to the promotion of peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, the provision of access to justice for all, and building effective, accountable institutions at all levels.
- Goal No. (17) strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development.

4: Preparedness of the State

During this phase the audit relied on the first methodology (review, evaluate the readiness of the state to implement the Sustainable Development Goals) through (7) seven assessment components.

4.1: Political commitment and believing in the existence of national responsibility towards the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals

The national responsibility and commitment of the State begun since signing the United Nations Convention on Sustainable Development Goals 2030 in September 2015, although, a large portion of these goals were included in the priorities of the state and its strategic Millennium Development Goal strategy ending in 2015, through 8 goals. A report has been made by the National Population Council for the period from 2010 and 2015.

A national mechanism for supervising the Sustainable Development Goals was also established by presidential decree No. (117) year 2016 issued 07 April 2016, just 8 months after signing the agreement, chaired by the Vice-President of the Republic and its headquarters in the ministry of social welfare which serves as secretariat of the mechanism *and* shall be composed *as follows*:-

Minister of Social Welfare	Vice-President
Minister of the Federal Affairs	Member
Minister for Foreign Affairs	Member
Minister of Information	Member
Minister of Finance and Economic Planning	Member
Minister of International Cooperation	Member
State minister at the Presidency	Member
State minister at the Ministry of the Council of Ministers	Member
Undersecretary, Ministry of Education	Member
State Minister of the Ministry of Welfare and Social Security	Member

Undersecretary , Ministry of Health	Member
Undersecretary , Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources and Urban Development	Member
Chairman of the Commission for Allocation and Monitoring the National Revenue	Member

Terms of reference and Tasks of the Mechanism

- i. Follow-up implementation of the National Program of Sustainable Development.
- ii. Verify the integration of the Sustainable Development Goals into the five-year plans of the State and the plans of ministries and development projects at the ministerial level.
- iii. Oversee the domestication of development goals at all governmental levels.
- iv. Provision of reliable and necessary data to measure progress in the national sustainable development program.
- v. Provide the resources and awareness for the national sustainable development program.
- vi. Provide financing for the national sustainable development program.

4.2: Create a state of public awareness on the Sustainable Development Goals, Encourage dialogue and engage with various stakeholders:

Based on the decision of the Council of Ministers No. (117) year 2016, phase (4) whereby the National Population Council was assigned as a national focal point for the National Program for Sustainable Development to undertake the following tasks:

- i. Coordinate with all partners to prepare the national program for sustainable development
- ii. Domesticate the Sustainable Development Goals and indicators.
- iii. Capacity building of the partners from formal and informal institutions, states and civil society organisations.
- iv. Follow-up the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals
 - v. Develop national and global reports.
 - vi. Create full awareness of development goals.

This is in addition to its main duties and responsibilities as stipulated in the Council's Law for the year 2008.

In this sense, the council has introduced and enlightened the objectives of sustainable development through several means.

- i. Seven television interviews were hosted by both Blue Nile and al-Shorooq TVs, attended by the secretary-general of the National Population Council, and Ms Marta, United Nations, Humanitarian Aid Coordinator and the Deputy Secretary-General of the Council.

- ii. Several awareness-raising programs on the Sustainable Development Goals have been implemented with the company ‘ProMedia’ under a contract at the cost of SP 280,000 in 2016.
- iii. Consultations and workshops were held with some ministries i.e. education, health, environment, agriculture and social welfare ,where the provinces has been briefed.
- iv. Visits were made to White Nile, Gazeria, Blue Nile, Sennar, Kassala, Gedaref, Red Sea, South Kordofan and West Darfur states aimed at informing and consulting the people on how to incorporate the Sustainable Development Goals into state plans.
- v. Communications and consultations held with civil society organisations resulted in establishing the National Forum of Civil Society Organisations for the Sustainable Development Goals. Besides that contacts were made with some research centres and women and youth sectors regarding the Sustainable Development Goals.
- vi. Consultations were held with some development partners such as the United Nations agency in December 2016 as well as participation with the United Nation Development Program to prepare and develop UNDAF and FAO and taking part in Zero Hunger strategy.
- vii. A number of campaigns on the Sustainable Development Goals were implemented with the participation of youth at the level of local governments in September 2017 at seven localities of Khartoum.
- viii. A set of notebooks and materials were printed on SDG 17, as a means to convey its message and education thereof. However, awareness-raising of those goals will be continued, according to the Deputy Secretary General of the Council.

4.3: Allocation of responsibilities at the level of governmental agencies and other stakeholders and the distribution of adequate financial resources and the establishment of accountability procedures.

4.3.1: Allocation of responsibilities to governmental agencies and stakeholders.

A. National Mechanism for overseeing the Sustainable Development Goals

A national mechanism was established by presidential decree no. (117) 2016, to oversee the Sustainable Development Goals, chaired by the Vice-President of the Republic. Its membership includes a number of ministers and under-secretaries in line with the functions and competencies set out in the presidential decree as referred in element (1) of this report.

A decision on chairmanship of the mechanism and its attribution to the council of ministers is expected, following the recommendation of the national reconciliation government concerning the separation of duties and tasks, according to the Minister of Social Welfare during his meeting on 01/10/2017 with the audit team.

Main achievements of the Mechanism since its establishment in April 2016

Four meetings have been held, the first of these meetings debated and introduced the Sustainable Development Goals. The second meeting discussed the national program for sustainable development 2016-2030, as well as the mechanism plans in terms of oversight and the mandate of the National Population Council as rapporteur of the mechanism in addition to the recommendation of establishing a portfolio committee on sustainable development. The third was an exceptional meeting attended by the ministries of finance, agriculture, social welfare, the National Population Council and the National Council for Strategic Planning, where the issues of poverty and its surveys and alignment of the Sustainable Development Goals were discussed. In this regard the fourth meeting addressed the statistical data and recommended that an information system for the Sustainable Development Goals should be created.

Audit observations

- i. No clear programs of action in accordance with specific timetables for this mechanism.
Inadequate performance of the mechanism from April 2016 to October 2017 (9 months). The output was 4 meetings only.
- ii. The mechanism's chairperson has not issued a decision to establish a national mechanism to oversee the Sustainable Development Goals at state level.
- iii. The mechanism has not overseen on updating the indicators and baseline. It still relies on data contained in the Millennium Development Goals Report which ended in 2015 and the results of the 2014 double survey.
- iv. Non-completion of indicators at the level of the executive units, for example, the ministry of education, which did not issue its statistical book on education indicators for the periods 2013-2014, 2014-2015, 2015-2016, 2016-2017.

B. National Population Council

Pursuant to presidential decree (117) of 2016, paragraph (4) of Council of minister's decision No. (115) of 2016, paragraph (2), the National Population Council was mandated as a fulcrum for the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals and as a rapporteur for the national mechanism and shall be responsible for the following tasks: -

- i. Coordinate with all partners to prepare the national program for sustainable development
- ii. Domesticate the Sustainable Development Goals and indicators.

- iii. Capacity building for partners from formal and informal institutions, states and civil society organisations.
- iv. Follow up implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals.
- v. Develop national and global reports.

Main Success of the Council

The council has delivered many of the entrusted tasks as indicated in element (2) of this report. It has also established a 47-member national team to assist in developing a plan for implementing the Sustainable Development Goals and engaged in developing the periodic national reports, and promoted capacity building of the provinces (states) in accordance with the administrative decree No.(13) dated on 2/11/2016 issued by the Secretary-General of the National Population Council.

Audit observations

- i. The sustainable development indicators haven't been updated, and still rely on the survey indicators of 2014 and the data of the Millennium Development Goals Report 2015.
- ii. No clear programs of action in accordance with specific timetables for the role of council to implement the development goals as stipulated in the presidential decree (117) particularly with regard to the advocacy aspect of the definition of sustainable development goals.

C. Integrating Sustainable Development Goals into the State's Strategy (National Council for Strategic Planning)

The Sustainable Development Goals, which were outlined in the UN document of 17 goals and 169 objectives, were integrated into the third strategy 2017-2020 at the federal and provincial levels. The audit reconciled these goals with the strategy according to its dependency on the executive sector.

D. Follow-Up and Accountability Actions

The Sustainable Development Goals in sectors and the executive units have been implemented respectively and monitored by the National Population Council through a form designed for the periodic reports of the units on every six -months to identify the progress made with regard to the implementation, and the role of relevant experts at the level of each executive unit.

E. Budgetary Resources

On 12/10/2017, the audit team met with the Under-Secretary for planning, Federal Ministry of Finance to identify the readiness of the Ministry to finance the Sustainable Development Goals

under the local level and foreign partnerships. He assured that the Sustainable Development Goals are funded within the five-year plan 2015-2019. The Ministry of Finance had no projects under the name of sustainable development at separate costs, whether at local level or foreign partnerships.

F. Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS)

Pursuant to the Central Bureau of Statistics Law (Article A / 9 presidential decree 2015 on the functions of the Council of Ministers), the tasks of the Central Bureau of Statistics are to conduct the national censuses, undertake qualitative surveys and manage statistical databases and make them available to various state agencies.

Based on the objectives and goals of the Central Bureau of Statistics published on its website www.cbs.gov.sd, paragraph (3) stipulates that the CBS

"participates in developing statistical systems to follow up the implementation of the economic and social development plan at the micro and macro level and prepare the information at implementation level"

Paragraph (5) states that CBS is to "develop the public technical rules and guidance that assists the state agencies and all other economic sectors in establishing statistics units and enhance the skills of their personnel"

Paragraph(6) stipulates that it should "collect, organize, unify, prepare, analyse and summarize the results of statistical information and all resources , and its uses for various aspects of the community activities in the appropriate time, and its processing, analysing, publishing, beside prepare the estimates for developing various statistical indicators".

The meeting with the Coordinator of the Central Bureau of Statistics on 16/10/2017, showed the following:

- i. The Bureau has not updated the indicators and baselines for the Sustainable Development Goals. It relies on data from the census of 2008, the multi-indicator cluster survey of 2014 and the poor families survey budget of 2014.
- ii. No statistical booklets have been published for the years 2014-2015-2016, CBS indicated that such booklets are being printed .
 - iii. 238 index indicators, are statistically classified into three categories
A –Group (1) Has a methodology and data, where its indicators can be calculated such as education, health, poverty and mortality, etc.

B –Group (2) indicators with methodology knowledge in terms of calculation but has no data source such as drugs and violence against women, corruption, road deaths and physical violence.

C: Group (3) Indicators with no methodolgoies or data source.

The Bureau adopted a strategy (2012-2016) to develop the statistical system in partnership with the UNDP Fund, and the most important of its goals is establishing statistical units in all sectors and ministries with regard to the production and use of statistical data. However the audit found during the meeting that the number of the established units in sector ministries are only 7. The African Development Bank has evaluated this strategy at the end of 2016 and recommended re-establishment an another strategy round as well as increased coordination with statistical units.

Element 4: Prepare the structured plans to implement the Sustainable Development Goals to ensure the preparation of these plans

The audit team was briefed on the sectoral plans of some ministries

- i. Ministry of Social Welfare
- ii. Ministry of Education
- iii. Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources and Urban Planning
- iv. Ministry of Agriculture

The Audit found that those goals have been turned into projects and integrated into the annual operational plans and ministries, such as the Ministry of Social Welfare, have also conducted studies to identify projects that require external funding. The audit recommends that this model be generalized to all ministries and executive units to guide them. However, these plans and projects have not yet been completed and the executive unit is still working on the cost of every project.

Element 5: Design and develop systems to measure the monitoring of the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals

According to the development desk officer at the National Population Council, no system has been designed to establish a control system so far, as the issues of the indicators have not been addressed as yet with the Central Bureau of Statistics.

Element 6: Establishing baselines to describe the situation at the onset of the implementation process of the various indicators against which progress will be judged

During the meeting of the audit team with the Secretary-General of the National Population Council and the development desk Officer, they stated that, at this stage the Council counts on the baseline contained in the Millennium Development report ended in 2015 and the results of 2014 double survey, data had not been updated at the time of the drafting of this report.

240 indicators were submitted; however, some goals have no related measurable indicators such as drugs, corruption, air pollution, violence against women, adolescent health and illegal pregnancy.

Element 7: Develop monitoring actions and delivery reports related to the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals involving all relevant stakeholders

A draft has been submitted for endorsement to the Council of Ministers and the Parliament on oversight for monitoring actions, follow-up, developing regulations and accountability, as mentioned by the Secretary-General of the National Council for Population.

5: Findings

- i. Delays in the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, given the date of signing the agreement in September 2015 (25 months), which negatively affected carrying out the goals within the period prescribed by the agreement.
- ii. Delays in setting up a national mechanism to oversee the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, which was formed in April 2016, eight months after the date of signing the agreement.
- iii. No clear and written programmes of action according to timelines for the implementation of both the mechanism and the National Population Council with regards to their respective tasks and missions, set out in presidential decree No. (117) of 2016. The mechanism held only four brainstorming meetings within the 19 months of its establishment.
- iv. The mechanism has not been established at state level to lead the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals.
- v. Indicators and baselines have not been updated for the Sustainable Development Goals. It relies on census data from 2008, the multi-indicator cluster survey of 2014 and the poor families survey budget of 2014. The Central Bureau of Statistics has to date not published the statistical monographs for the years 2014, 2015, 2016.
- vi. A severe lack of indicator data on some goals of the Central Bureau of Statistics. There is no sources for data for some goals, despite the existence of a methodology for their calculation. Some issues such as drugs, corruption, violence against women and road deaths have no methodologies and data sources.
- vii. Finance: There are no arrangements at the level of the federal finance ministry to fund implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals as indicated by the undersecretary of the ministry during his meeting with the audit team on 10/10/2017. Thus, the Sustainable Development Goals are funded within the five-year plan 2015-2019. There are no projects under the name of sustainable

development at separate costs neither on local level nor through foreign partnerships.

6: Recommendations

- i. Strengthening the role of the Mechanism to play its part towards the implementation the Sustainable Development Goals and make progress according to the period prescribed by the agreement.
- ii. The Mechanism should oversee the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals and the National Population Council must develop plans and clear programmes of action to supervise the Sustainable Development Goals.
- iii. A resolution should be issued by the chairman of the national mechanism to establish a national mechanism at state level to lead the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals.
- iv. Provide and update the indicators related to the Sustainable Development Goals, this could be done when the Mechanism plays its role in cooperation with the Central Bureau of Statistics as having the primary -responsibility for the production of these data, for ministries and executive sectors.
- v. Upgrade the Central Bureau of Statistics whereby it meets all data requirements at the proper time.